

CSOs Review of National Accountability Mechanism for SDG 6

PAKISTAN



6 CLEAN WATER
AND SANITATION



Contents

- 1. Introduction 3
- 2. Country Reporting on SDG 6 5
- 3. Accountability Mechanisms, Platforms or Systems 5
- 4. CSOs’ Participation in Accountability Mechanisms, Platforms or Systems 6
- 5. Positive experiences of participation in SDG Processes 7
- 6. Areas of Improvement 7
- 7. Good Accountability Practices 8
- 8. Conclusion and Recommendations..... 8

Executive Summary

This study has been conducted to gauge the progress made so far towards achieving Sustainable Development Goal 6 in Pakistan since its inception. The main purpose of this study is to review the existing accountability mechanism available in the country and by analyzing these mechanisms, recommend improvements to achieve the good accountability mechanism in Pakistan. This study is based on the interviews with key informants/ active players of the WASH sector and information available on online.

Draft Pakistan - Country Level Mapping of SDGs

1. Introduction

Pakistan committed in 2015, with the rest of the world, to meeting the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) by 2030. The Government of Pakistan, and the Planning Commission in particular, has made a strong commitment to the SDGs and is putting an action plan into place that engages national and provincial actors, international donors, non-governmental organizations, private enterprise, and the education sector.

In February 2016 Pakistan adopted the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) as part of its national development agenda through a National Assembly Resolution. The SDG Taskforces were established in Pakistan's national and provincial assemblies to oversee progress on the goals. The efforts are being made by Govt of Pakistan to translate SDG targets in national policies and strategies, including the Five-Year Plan, provincial growth strategies and Pakistan's long-term development perspective. The 12th Five Year Plan and provincial medium-term development strategies are other efforts to align with the 2030 Agenda. In 2018, the newly elected Government designed and approved **National SDGs Framework** [https://www.pc.gov.pk/uploads/report/National SDGs Framework - NEC 2018.pdf](https://www.pc.gov.pk/uploads/report/National%20SDGs%20Framework%20-%20NEC%202018.pdf) that envisages a national vision to prioritize and localize SDGs. This Framework sets baselines and targets for SDG indicators. It is supposed to feed into the SDGs' Monitoring and Evaluation Framework. The framework is to provide guidelines to the provinces and federally administered areas to determine their development priorities, based on local needs. The SDG units have been established at federal and provincial in Pakistan for coordination, monitoring and evaluation.

The provincial Govts. have formed Technical Committees and Thematic Clusters to strengthen the implementation of the SDGs. The nomination of focal persons at all levels of government, down to the districts, will help to align their development priorities with the 2030 Agenda. National data collection tools are being modified to improve data availability to gauge progress towards SDGs. Government of Pakistan has done analysis of data gaps related to the SDGs.

Pakistan's progress on SDG 6 can be reviewed by focusing on its policies and plans towards achieving SDG 6 targets. The country is following National Sanitation Policy 2006. and the National Water Policy 2018. Pakistan adopted "Pakistan Approach to Total Sanitation" (PATS) in 2010. <https://www.communityledtotalsanitation.org/resource/pakistan-approach-total-sanitation-pats> The Ministry of Climate Change, Govt. Of Pakistan has, however, drafted national drinking water and sanitation policies in 2017 but still have not been approved mainly due to change in the government. Both the draft national policies, however, have been aligned with the SDG 6.

Water & sanitation is a provincial subject after 18th amendment in the constitution of Pakistan. The country has four provinces and federally administered areas. The two provinces i.e. Sindh and Baluchistan have made water & sanitation policies in 2017 which are aligned with the SDG 6. The draft policies in the other two provinces are in

pipelines for approval. These draft policies are also aligned with the SDG 6. The largest province in terms of population is Punjab which has recently promulgated, first of its kind, Punjab Water Act 2019. This act mainly addresses water conservation and water supply mechanism.

The new government has made a plan “Clean Green Program Pakistan” which is theoretically aligned with SDG 6. The main features of this initiative are as under;

1. Revised National Guidelines and Provincial Policies for Drinking Water, Sanitation and Behavioral Change Strategies.
2. legislative review of all existing legislation related to drinking water, sanitation and solid waste management i.e. National and Provincial Environment Protection Act, Local Government Acts, Irrigation and Groundwater Act, Cities Development Act, etc.
3. Review of existing federal and provincial Rules of Business along with other relevant laws for a clear roles and accountability among departments
4. Development of a consensus among stakeholders to formulate a regulator for drinking water and sanitation as WASH Commission
5. Mapping of water, sanitation, hygiene and waste collection and disposal mechanisms in the hospitals, academic institutes, government buildings and all key markets in the district and sub district levels along key hotspots.
6. Develop National Faecal Sludge Management Guidelines and facilitate the provinces in its implementation
7. Review the Industrial waste management mechanisms and develop guidelines for the industries for its effective implementation.
8. Monitor and report with clear reward and punishment mechanisms for appropriate management of municipal, solid and industrial waste management.
9. Design, implement and monitor an effective behavioral change campaign for Green and Clean Pakistan with initial focus on open defecation free environment
10. Capacity assessment of existing service providers including human as well as physical infrastructure i.e. Local Government, Health, Education, Markets, etc.
11. Prioritize the allocation of funds by the finance department to cover the gaps in the capacities
12. The excluded groups like women, girls, persons with disabilities, ethnic, minorities will be given preference in the design and implementation of green and clean Pakistan interventions
13. Develop an effective Monitoring and Reporting System for Green and Clean Pakistan
14. Introduce a national portal for Clean Green Pakistan to track the progress and interventions

2. Country Reporting on SDG 6

There is no single regulatory and monitoring authority for carrying out M&E and reporting on WASH. Each province carries out WASH activities in its jurisdiction and also compiles data. Pakistan Bureau of Statistics (PBS) is the national custodian of tracking and reporting the progress on SDGs.

Ministry of Climate Change has been entrusted the role of policy formulation, standards setting, reporting and coordination for regional and international commitments. In order to strengthen the institutional arrangements at the national level, the MoCC has created a Water, Sanitation and Hygiene (WASH) Strategic Unit in 2018. The unit has been working with only one professional staff member. This unit formed Sector Coordination Committee, headed by the Secretary, ministry of Climate Change, Govt. of Pakistan for better coordination of all stakeholders at federal level. Though the meetings of this committee are held off and on where stakeholders coordinate and communicate their concerns. The process, however, need regularity which is missing due to lack of formal institutional arrangement. The ministry has been assigned the task of WASH a couple of years before but still there is no permanent section/ staff looking after WASH. A PC1 (project document) worth Rs 40 million has been approved in the federal budget 2019 -2020 by the government to staff the unit for three years but the recruitment process has not yet been completed. With this week institutional arrangement, no regular coordination/ monitoring is possible.

3. Accountability Mechanisms, Platforms or Systems

The MoCC and PBS brought different stakeholders together in 2017 and 2018 for developing consensus on the indicators and methods of data collection for tracking and planning.

There is a National Advisory Committee on the SDGs, chaired by the Minister for Planning Development & Reforms. The Committee includes representatives from the federal and provincial governments and SDG Taskforces. The Committee provides strategic leadership for achieving the SDGs, while guiding effective cross-sectoral and inter-provincial coordination.

Provincial governments have to establish Provincial Advisory Committees. These committees are supposed to support the formulation of provincial SDG framework. These committees have not yet been notified in three provinces except Punjab.

Pakistan gathers data/ records of evidence through main sources; Pakistan Social & Living Standard Measurement (PSLM) Survey, Joint Monitoring Program (JMP), Multi Cluster Indicator Survey (MICS), Household Integrated Economic Survey (HIES), National Nutrition Survey (NNS)

The question in all the data sets are now aligned with SDG 6. Like MICS, MICS and NNS have the same questions. These questions were prepared for MICS initially but these are made part of PSLM and NNS. The PSLM gathers economic data on poverty while NNS will cover nutritional side of WASH. The purpose of keeping the questions on WASH in different data sets is to see SDG standard against different

dimensions like poverty, nutrition etc. MICS will cover even at grass root level district level. PSLM data is more reliable as it is a regular practice since long.

The Joint Sector Reviews being held regularly in all the provinces. The report of JSR in Sindh province has been used by UNDP by preparing an economic paper. In Baluchistan, it was used in an advocacy paper to prepare master plan and use it to enhance budget allocations for the sector. So, it has a direct linkage with budget. In Punjab, the report of JSR has been published in Economic Growth Strategy of the province. Previously there was no WASH requirements mentioned in the Growth Strategy. This has provided the decision makers to have clear vision about budget allocation for the sector. In KPK province the JSR report is used for making master plan of WASH. These all JSRs report are now directly linked with the sector ministers and finance ministers. At national level, first time in the history of the country, a new chapter has been introduced in Economic Survey of Pakistan on WASH. There were complete chapters on health & education in it but WASH was never part of it. The Economic Survey of Pakistan is prepared by the ministry of Finance, Govt of Pakistan. The report has recently been launched by the Finance minister. The same costing for the sector has been used for SDG 6 which was prepared by the ministry of Climate Change. The finance ministry is of the view that if the country wants economic growth, it needs to spend that much amount of money.

As a result of all these efforts, the financial allocations have been increased at provincial as well as national level. Two billion rupees have been allocated for Clean & Green Pakistan at national level first time at national level. Previously, there was no allocation for WASH in federal Public Sector Development Program (PSDP)

4. CSOs' Participation in Accountability Mechanisms, Platforms or Systems

The space for NGOs/ CSOs functioning in Pakistan is shrinking day by day. Most of the INGOs have been asked to close their operations in the country. Similarly, local NGOs are facing financial as well as operational issues. Due to limited support available, the role of NGOs/CSOs in contributing towards achievement of national goals is very limited.

The NGOs are involved in Joint Sector Reviews but in Steering Committees, their involvement is limited. Although the role of NGOs in supporting Governments through software activities has increased as Clean Green Pakistan index, a web portal recently launched by Government of Pakistan where individual volunteers can register themselves but there is no mechanism to engage organizations in the web portal. This issue has been raised during a recent Sector Partners meeting in Islamabad and it was ensured by the govt. representative that the mechanism to involve organizations will be introduced.

5. Positive experiences of participation in SDG Processes

Govt in principal involves CSOs in processes from federal to provincial level. At federal level, there is Sector Coordination Committee where all sector partners meet and discuss the progress of achievements towards SDG 6. Joint Sector Reviews at provincial level are another opportunity for CSOs to learn and oversee the progress of provincial govts towards achieving SDG goals.

6. Areas of Improvement

Generally, the govt is reluctant to engage with CSOs due to multiple reasons. Traditionally govt functionaries consider CSOs as their rivals. The state structure here is not made to be answerable to public. The CSOs phenomenon was considered a foreign agenda in the eyes of most of the public servants. With this state of mind, it was very hard to work with the govt institutions.

At provincial and local level, duplication and in some cases multiplication of agencies responsible for the provision of WASH services is a serious issue in the implementation of SDG targets and monitoring progress. There is no cross sectoral coordination mechanism exists. Provincial WASH Steering Committee has been notified since long in Punjab but its meetings have never been held except one. Even the coordination among the provincial government departments responsible for WASH, is practically missing. There is no formal say of CSOs, private sector or academia in the planning, implementation or monitoring of WASH at provincial level. We can take the example of provincial WASH steering committees and Joint Sector Reviews held at provincial level. In the major province, Punjab, there is no functional WASH steering committee. Even the recent Joint Sector Review was held halfheartedly by the provincial Public Health Engineering Department. The other provincial department i.e. Local Govt & Community Development department did not present any plans/ projects during the JSR. The situation in other provinces and federally administered areas is not much different.

It is felt by the stakeholders that there is a dire need of robust and inclusive mutual accountability framework/ mechanism both at federal and provincial level. The govt need to institutionalize/ formalize this mechanism by providing policy/ legal support to this mechanism where all stakeholders are answerable for their plans and commitments. In Pakistan, due to weak political governments and other factors, no such mechanisms could be strengthened. Sometimes, the committees are formed but their functionality/ effectiveness always suffer due to lack of interest by the concerned govt functionaries and lack of political will by the govt.

CSOs participation as an individual or network is very crucial for improving the accountability mechanism in the country. FANSA has been part of the mechanism since beginning. However, to improve its efficiency at provincial level as well, it has started expanding its membership base and many new members have been made part of the network which are otherwise very active in the sector. The network is being strengthened by electing new provincial focal persons and advisors in the provinces. At national level, new National Steering Committee is being formed to accelerate the sector coordination and better monitoring of government and development partners programs.

7. Good Accountability Practices

The Joint Sector Reviews have played an important role in enabling good accountability mechanism in Pakistan. The role of CSOs in these JSRs is however, need to be improved.

There is another approach for CSOs to hold government agencies responsible in relation to spending public money. Two important areas are there to do so. First by mobilizing community/ local resources to build small scale lane and neighbourhood level WASH infrastructure and then invite local municipalities to share their resources and development budget related information with the communities and CSOs. This helps CSOs to make local governments accountable for effective use of public money.

Second is the use and analyse the provincial and national level data gathered through different data sets like NNS, PSLM, JMP and MICS etc. This helps CSOs to understand the big picture and enable them to highlight the issues in front of communities and govt agencies.

8. Conclusion and Recommendations

Accountability mechanism in Pakistan is still in progress. The role of CSOs, academia and private sector is however, being acknowledged. It is practiced at federal government and in Sindh and KPK provinces comparatively at better level. The role of these stakeholders needs to be formalized and enhanced to achieve good accountability mechanism.

There is a strong need to frame laws and rules to make govt departments bound to engage CSOs, academia in all their development projects at all levels. Without laws and rules, govt departments will never bother to engage CSOs in their functions.

CSOs network like FANSA need to be strengthened as the individual CSOs can never raise strong voices and send messages to the govt agencies responsible for provision of services. For this purpose, financial support from different development partners is a must requirement for effective advocacy campaigns.

The good accountability practices which are being used at smaller scale and only by few organizations need to be adopted by other CSOs and networks to achieve good accountability mechanism. There are a lot of opportunities where CSOs could show their worth with on ground progress. With this approach, some of the CSOs have earned good reputation among general public and govt functionaries.

The main bottleneck for the CSOs and network (FANSA) is the non-availability of financial resources.